

Notice of Decision and Reasons for Decision

| | |
|------------------------|--|
| Applicant: | 'EO6' |
| Agency: | City of Greater Dandenong |
| Decision date: | 10 June 2022 |
| Exemptions considered: | Sections 32(1), 33(1), 34(1)(b), and 38 of the <i>Freedom of Information Act 1982</i> (Vic) in conjunction with section 125(1) of the <i>Local Government Act 2020</i> (Vic) |
| Citation: | 'EO6' and <i>City of Greater Dandenong</i> (Freedom of Information) [2022] VICmr 160 (10 June 2022) |

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION – legal professional privilege – invoices – commercial in confidence – disclosure would expose a business undertaking unreasonably to disadvantage

All references to legislation in this document are to the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* (Vic) (**FOI Act**) unless otherwise stated.

Notice of Decision

I have conducted a review under section 49F of the Agency's decision to refuse access to documents requested by the Applicant under the FOI Act.

My decision on the Applicant's request differs from the Agency's decision in that I have decided to release additional information in the documents where I am satisfied it is not exempt from release.

However, I am satisfied certain information in the documents is exempt under sections 32(1), 33(1), 34(1)(b), and 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the *Local Government Act 2020* (Vic) (**LG Act**).

As I am satisfied it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of the documents with exempt information deleted in accordance with section 25, access to the documents is granted in part.

The Schedule of Documents in **Annexure 1** sets out my decision in relation to each document.

My reasons for decision follow.

Joanne Kummrow
Public Access Deputy Commissioner

10 June 2022

Reasons for Decision

Background to review

1. The Applicant made a request seeking access to the following documents:
 - A copy of all cost agreements and invoices for legal costs incurred by the City of Greater Dandenong in all matters relating to [private company] for the period [date] to [date].
 - A copy of all invoices for media and public relations training for staff for the period [date] to [date].
2. The Applicant advised they do not seek access to personal information on non-executive staff and will accept an edited copy of documents.
3. The Agency identified 50 documents relevant to the terms of the Applicant's request and refused access to each of the documents in full under sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), and 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the LG Act.
4. The Agency's decision letter sets out the reasons for its decision.

Review

5. The Applicant sought review by the Information Commissioner under section 49A(1) of the Agency's decision to refuse access.
6. I have examined a copy of the documents subject to review.
7. The Applicant and the Agency were invited to make a written submission under section 49H(2) in relation to the review.
8. I have considered all communications and submissions received from the parties.
9. In undertaking my review, I have had regard to the object of the FOI Act, which is to create a general right of access to information in the possession of the Government or other public bodies, limited only by exceptions and exemptions necessary to protect essential public interests, privacy and business affairs.
10. I note Parliament's intention the FOI Act must be interpreted so as to further the object of the Act and any discretions conferred by the Act must be exercised, as far as possible, so as to facilitate and promote the disclosure of information in a timely manner and at the lowest reasonable cost.
11. In conducting a review under section 49F, section 49P requires that I make a new or 'fresh decision'. Therefore, my review does not involve determining whether the Agency's decision is correct, but rather requires my fresh decision is the 'correct or preferable decision'. This involves ensuring my decision is correctly made under the FOI Act and any other applicable law in force at the time of making my fresh decision.

Submissions

12. The Agency provided submissions in confidence. In summary, the Agency submits:
 - (a) In relation to section 32(1), the communications in the exempt documents relate to the provision of legal services to the Agency by its external legal advisers.
 - (b) In relation to the application of section 34(1)(b), disclosure of the invoices would reveal the hourly rate and billing practices of the external legal advisers. The disclosure of this

information could place the commercial undertakings at a competitive disadvantage and cause harm to the competitive position of each undertaking which operate within a competitive legal services market.

Review of exemptions

Section 38 – Document to which a secrecy provision applies

13. A document is exempt under section 38 if the following three requirements are met:
- (a) there is an enactment in force;
 - (b) the enactment applies specifically to the kind of information in a document; and
 - (c) the enactment prohibits persons, referred to in the enactment, from disclosing that specific kind of information (either absolutely or subject to exceptions or qualifications).
14. For section 38 to apply to a document, an enactment must be formulated with such precision that it specifies the actual information sought to be withheld.

Is there an enactment in force?

15. Section 125 of the LG Act provides:

125 Confidential information

- (1) Unless subsection (2) or (3) applies, a person who is, or has been, a Councillor, a member of a delegated committee or a member of Council staff, must not intentionally or recklessly disclose information that the person knows, or should reasonably know, is confidential information.
- Penalty: 120 penalty units.
- (2) Subsection (1) does not apply if the information that is disclosed is information that the Council has determined should be publicly available.
- (3) A person who is, or has been, a Councillor, a member of a delegated committee or a member of Council staff, may disclose information that the person knows, or should reasonably know, is confidential information in the following circumstances—
- (a) for the purposes of any legal proceedings arising out of this Act;
 - (b) to a court or tribunal in the course of legal proceedings;
 - (c) pursuant to an order of a court or tribunal;
 - (d) in the course of an internal arbitration and for the purposes of the internal arbitration process;
 - (e) in the course of a Councillor Conduct Panel hearing and for the purposes of the hearing;
 - (f) to a Municipal Monitor to the extent reasonably required by the Municipal Monitor;
 - (g) to the Chief Municipal Inspector to the extent reasonably required by the Chief Municipal Inspector;
 - (h) to a Commission of Inquiry to the extent reasonably required by the Commission of Inquiry;
 - (i) to the extent reasonably required by a law enforcement agency.

16. I am satisfied the LG Act is an enactment in force for the purpose of section 38.

Does the enactment apply specifically to the kind of information in the documents?

17. The term 'confidential information' is defined in section 3(1) of the LG Act, and includes the following categories of information:
- (e) legal privileged information, being information to which legal professional privilege or client legal privilege applies;
 - (f) personal information, being information which if released would result in the unreasonable disclosure of information about any person or their personal affairs;
 - (g) private commercial information, being information provided by a business, commercial or financial undertaking–
 - i. relates to trade secrets; or
 - ii. if released, would unreasonably expose the business, commercial or financial undertaking to disadvantage;
18. The above categories of information in the definition of 'confidential information', overlap with the exemptions under sections 32(1), 33(1) and 34(1)(b) of the FOI Act, which I consider in turn below.

Do the documents contain 'legal privileged information' for the purpose of section 125(1) of the LG Act?

19. In determining whether the documents contain 'legal privileged information' I have had regard to similar consideration that arise under section 32(1) of the FOI Act, whereby a document will be subject to legal professional privilege where it contains a confidential communication:¹
- (a) between the client (or the client's agent) and the client's professional legal advisers, that was made for the dominant purpose of obtaining or providing legal advice or is referable to pending or contemplated litigation; or
 - (b) between the client's professional legal advisers and third parties, that was made for the dominant purpose of pending or contemplated litigation; or
 - (c) between the client (or the client's agent) and third parties that was made for the purpose of obtaining information to be submitted to the client's professional legal advisers for the dominant purpose of obtaining advice on pending or contemplated litigation.
20. Where a question of legal professional privilege arises, the Agency must establish the dominant purpose for preparing the document was either for the purpose of obtaining or providing legal advice, or alternatively for anticipated litigation.² These are referred to as 'advice privilege' and 'litigation privilege' respectively.
21. 'Purpose' in the phrase 'dominant purpose' means the purpose that led to the creation of the document or the making of the communication.³ The relevant time at which a claim for privilege is to be determined is the time when the document came into existence.⁴
22. Further, the 'dominant purpose' requires the primary or substantial reason for the communication for privilege to attach.⁵ Where there are mixed purposes, the paramount purpose must be identified. Where two purposes are of equal weight, neither will be dominant. If the decision to bring a

¹ *Graze v Commissioner of State Revenue* [2013] VCAT 869 at [29]; *Elder v Worksafe Victoria* [2011] VCAT 1029 at [22]. See also section 119 of the *Evidence Act 2008* (Vic).

² *Grant v Downs* 135 CLR 674 at 689.

³ *Carnell v Mann* (1998) 89 FCR 247 at 253.

⁴ *Telstra Corporation Limited v Minister for Communications, Information technology and the Arts (No.2)* [2007] FCA 1445 at [28].

⁵ *Ibid.*

document into existence would have been made, irrespective of obtaining legal advice, the latter purpose cannot be dominant.⁶

23. As the High Court of Australia observed:

The rationale of this head of privilege, according to traditional doctrine, is that it promotes the public interest because it assists and enhances the administration of justice by facilitating the representation of clients by legal advisers, the law being a complex and complicated discipline. This it does by keeping secret their communications, thereby inducing the client to retain the solicitor and seek his advice, and encouraging the client to make a full and frank disclosure of the relevant circumstances to the solicitor.⁷

24. In this matter, the Agency refused access to all documents on the basis they disclose summaries of confidential communications that were made for the dominant purpose of the Agency obtaining or providing legal advice.

25. In *Hodgson v Amcor; Amcor Ltd v Barnes Anor (No. 2)*⁸ (**Amcor decision**), the Supreme Court of Victoria summarised the position with respect to memoranda of fees or solicitor fee/time ledgers and legal professional privilege:⁹

It is accepted that legal professional privilege attaches to a communication undertaken, or to a document brought into existence, for the dominant purpose of giving or obtaining legal advice. At first glance, a memorandum of professional costs or a time ledger prepared by a solicitor does not have this dominant purpose. It is prepared for the purpose of accounting to the client for work done, and rendering a bill of costs in respect of it.

However, and subject to meeting the dominant purpose test, legal professional privilege also protects the disclosure of documents that record legal work carried out by the lawyer for the benefit of the client. In these cases, the protection extends to notes, memoranda or other documents made by a lawyer that relate to information sought by the client to enable him or her to advise.

...

In the usual case, a memorandum of fees is brought into existence, not for the dominant purpose of obtaining legal advice or for use in legal proceedings but principally for the purpose of recording and raising charges in respect of work which had been already completed. In such a case, where, for example the memorandum of fees merely set out the dates and refers to the action taken in respect of which a charge is made, no privilege will attach. This was the case in *Lake Cumbeline*.¹⁰

...

However, cases where memoranda or bills of costs rendered by a solicitor are in detailed form and disclose, either directly or indirectly, communications concerning matters that are protected by the privilege, including instructions given by a client to his solicitors, the advice given, approaches to potential witnesses and other such things, stand in an altogether different class. Such memoranda and bills of costs are likewise privileged.

Were the position to be otherwise, it would work to undermine the privilege and the public policy it seeks to advance. It would have the consequence that a party, while initially at least being able to seek legal advice and initiate the creation of documents for use in legal proceedings fully protected by legal professional privilege, would risk losing the benefits of the privilege when it comes time to pay for the legal services provided. If this was to occur, in my opinion the outcome would “substantially impede freedom of communication between client and legal advisers, which is at the very heart of the privilege, by discouraging free and uninhibited discussion of the issues and questions in the fear that these communications could later be disclosed to the severe disadvantage of the client”.¹¹

⁶ SM Preuss, in *Ormonde v Darebin CC* [2008] VCAT 588 at [24] citing *Cross on Evidence*, Australian loose leaf edition, 25115 at [25240].

⁷ *Grant v Downs* (1976) 135 CLR 674 at [19].

⁸ [2011] VSC 204.

⁹ *Ibid* at [56]-[63].

¹⁰ *Lake Cumbeline Pty Ltd & Ors v Effem Foods Pty Ltd* (1994) 126 ALR 58 at [68].

¹¹ Citing Tamberlin J in *Lake Cumbeline* (1994) 126 ALR 58 at [62].

26. Therefore, the question to be determined is whether the invoices as a whole disclose, directly or indirectly, communications subject to legal professional privilege.
27. Each document has a cover page containing a brief description of services provided and total invoiced amount. The documents also include details on how to pay the invoice, and 'Details of account', which includes a table outlining the hourly rate for each external lawyer who undertook work on the matter and a schedule of 'professional services' that provides a narration, set out in dot points, of discrete tasks performed. The degree of detail differs between each invoice.
28. Having reviewed each document, I have determined parts of the documents set out in detail tasks performed and narrations that disclose, either directly or indirectly, communications concerning matters protected by legal professional privilege between the Agency and its external legal advisers. I am satisfied the relevant parts of the documents would disclose information provided for the dominant purpose of providing legal advice to the Agency and is exempt from release under section 32(1).
29. However, where the documents disclose financial information, dates and information of an administrative nature, such as case references, I am not satisfied disclosure, either directly or indirectly, would disclose instructions or other communications concerning matters that are subject to legal professional privilege.
30. In *Commissioner of State Revenue v Tucker (Review and Regulation)*¹² (**Tucker decision**) the Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal (**VCAT**) held that invoices from legal advisers taken individually and collectively could disclose activity taken in litigation. This review can be distinguished from the Tucker decision on the basis the FOI Applicant in the Tucker decision had special knowledge of the invoices, having been directly involved in the relevant proceedings. The Applicant in this matter has no special knowledge of the Agency's legal matters, [background information redacted]
31. Therefore, I am not satisfied the entire content of each invoice contains information that discloses, either directly or indirectly, 'legal privileged communications'. Accordingly, I am not satisfied each of the invoices, as a whole, comprises 'confidential information' for the purpose of section 125(1) of the LG Act.

Do the documents contain 'private commercial information' for the purpose of section 125(1) of the LG Act?

32. A document will contain 'private commercial information' if it contains information provided by a business commercial or financial undertaking that:
 - (a) relates to trade secrets; or
 - (b) if released, would unreasonably expose the business, commercial or financial undertaking to disadvantage.
33. The definition of 'private commercial information' is similarly worded to section 34(1)(b), however, it has a higher threshold than section 34(1)(b). The threshold for 'private commercial information' is that disclosure of the information *would* expose the business undertaking unreasonably to disadvantage, whereas section 34(1)(b) only requires that the information would be *likely* to expose the business undertaking unreasonably to disadvantage.
34. The Agency submits:
 - (a) section 34(1)(b) applies to the documents as each invoice reveals the particular rates and fees incurred for the legal services provided;

¹² [2021] VCAT 238 (19 March 2021).

- (b) disclosure of the commercial information would be likely to expose the relevant legal firms and barristers unreasonably to disadvantage as it would impact their competitive position in the legal services market; and
 - (c) as the business information relates to current legal proceedings, this increases the sensitivity of the information.
35. For the purpose of this review, I accept the information was acquired by the Agency from the relevant business undertakings. I also accept the information relates to matters of a business, commercial or financial nature. Therefore, it is necessary to determine whether disclosure of the documents would expose the relevant business undertakings unreasonably to disadvantage.
36. In accordance with section 34(3), the Agency advised it consulted with third party undertakings whose business information appears in the documents. I have viewed their responses, noting the undertakings object to the release of their business, commercial and financial information.
37. I have considered VCAT's reasoning in *Coulson v Department of Premier and Cabinet*¹³ (**Coulson decision**) in which it determined that itemised lists of professional services in relation to legal fees were exempt from release under section 34(1)(b). This was on the basis that charge-out rates identified in the documents could, if released, expose external legal advisers to disadvantage in the legal services market.
38. Having considered the information before me and noting the timing of the application as it relates to the financial arrangements of current legal proceedings, I am satisfied similar information in the documents would expose the business undertakings unreasonably to disadvantage.
39. However, where the documents do not detail an individual legal adviser's charge-out rates (for example, invoice dates, administrative expenses, filing fees and total amounts charged), I do not consider the information is commercially sensitive in nature such that its disclosure would expose the legal adviser unreasonably to disadvantage. Therefore, the dates and total amounts owing in the documents comprises 'confidential information' for the purpose of section 125(1) of the LG Act.

Do the documents contain 'personal information' for the purpose of section 125(1) of the LG Act?

40. As noted above, the term 'confidential information' is defined in section 3(1) of the LG Act 2020, and includes under subsection 3(1)(f), 'personal information, being information which if released would result in the unreasonable disclosure of information about any person or their personal affairs'.
41. The definition of 'confidential information' in the LG Act overlaps with the exemption under section 33(1) of the FOI Act, which provides a document is an exempt document if its disclosure:
- (a) would 'involve' the disclosure of information relating to the 'personal affairs' of a person other than the Applicant (a **third party**);¹⁴ and
 - (b) would be 'unreasonable'.
42. Given the overlap in definitions, in determining whether a document contains 'personal information' about any person or their personal affairs, and whether its disclosure would be unreasonable in the circumstances, I have had regard to similar considerations that arise under section 33(1).
43. I have also taken into consideration the definition of 'personal affairs information' in section 33(9) of the FOI Act, which provides that information relating to a person's personal affairs includes

¹³ [2018] VCAT 229.

¹⁴ Sections 33(1) and 33(2).

information that identifies any person or discloses their address or location. It also includes any information from which such information may be reasonably determined.¹⁵

44. As part of their original FOI request, the Applicant advised they do not seek access to personal affairs information of non-executive staff. During the review, the Applicant clarified they only seek access to personal affairs information of executive level Agency officers. Accordingly, the personal affairs information of third parties who are not employees of the Agency and Agency officers who are not executive level is not subject to review and is irrelevant information for the purpose of this review. Therefore, my review will only consider whether it is unreasonable to release the personal affairs information executive staff. Where the documents contain names and contact information of non-executive staff and other third parties, this information is to remain deleted as irrelevant information under section 25.
45. In relation to section 33(1), the concept of 'unreasonable disclosure' involves balancing the public interest in the disclosure of official information with the interest in protecting a third party's personal privacy in the particular circumstances. I see this concept as similarly applicable to my consideration of whether certain information constitutes 'confidential information' for the purpose of section 125(1) of the LG Act.
46. In *Victoria Police v Marke*,¹⁶ the Victorian Court of Appeal held there is 'no absolute bar to providing access to documents which relate to the personal affairs of others'. Further, the exemption under section 33(1) 'arises only in cases of unreasonable disclosure' and '[w]hat amounts to an unreasonable disclosure of someone's personal affairs will necessarily vary from case to case'.¹⁷ The Court further held, '[t]he protection of privacy, which lies at the heart of [section] 33(1), is an important right that the FOI Act properly protects. However, an individual's privacy can be invaded by a lesser or greater degree'.¹⁸
47. Having considered the documents and the context of this matter, I do not consider it would be unreasonable to release the personal information of executive Agency officers in the documents. I am of the view this information is not sensitive as it relates solely to Agency officers in the context of them performing their professional duties or responsibilities.
48. However, I consider the signatures and direct email addresses of third parties in the documents constitutes personal information and would be unreasonable to release. I do not consider release of this information would aid the Applicant in their understanding of the documents, nor do I consider this information is widely available. Therefore, I have determined the individuals' personal privacy outweighs the public interest in disclosure.
49. I am also required to consider whether disclosure of the information would be reasonably likely to endanger the life or physical safety of any person.¹⁹ There is no information before me to suggest this is a relevant factor in this matter.
50. Accordingly, I am satisfied certain 'personal information' in the documents is 'confidential information' for the purpose of section 125(1) of the LG Act.

Conclusion of assessment under section 38

51. I am satisfied section 38 applies to certain information in the documents as:
 - (a) section 125 of the LG Act is an enactment in force;

¹⁵ Section 33(9).

¹⁶ [2008] VSCA 218 at [76].

¹⁷ *Ibid.*

¹⁸ *Ibid* at [79].

¹⁹ This is a mandatory factor to be considered under section 33(2A).

- (b) the definition of 'confidential information' and the categories of information in sections 3(1)(e), 3(1)(f) and 3(1)(g) of the LG Act refer specifically to the relevant information in the documents; and
- (c) section 125(1) of the LG Act prohibits Agency officers, specifically councillors and council staff, from disclosing 'confidential information'.

52. Accordingly, I am satisfied certain information is exempt under section 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the LG Act.

53. My decision in relation to section 38 is set out in the Schedule of Documents at **Annexure 1**.

Other exemptions

54. Where I am satisfied information is 'confidential information' as it contains 'personal information' or 'legal privileged information', I am also satisfied it is exempt from release under the overlapping exemptions under sections 32(1) and 33(1).

55. Similarly, where I am satisfied information is 'private commercial information' I am also satisfied it is exempt from release under section 34(1)(b). However, where the information does not detail the charge-out rates of individual legal advisers (for example, invoice dates, administrative expenses, filing fees and total amounts charged), I do not consider disclosure of this information would be likely to expose an external legal advisor unreasonably to disadvantage. Therefore, I am not satisfied this information is exempt from release under section 34(1)(b).

Section 25 – Deletion of exempt or irrelevant information

56. Section 25 requires an agency to grant access to an edited copy of a document where it is practicable to delete exempt or irrelevant information and the applicant agrees to receiving such a copy.

57. Determining what is 'practicable' requires consideration of the effort and editing involved in making the deletions 'from a resources point of view'²⁰ and the effectiveness of the deletions. Where deletions would render a document meaningless, they are not 'practicable', and release of the document is not required under section 25.²¹

58. As noted above, the Applicant does not seek access to the personal affairs information of non-executive level staff, third parties who are not Agency employees or the banking details of the Agency's legal adviser. Such information is to remain deleted as it is irrelevant information.

59. I have considered whether it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of the documents with irrelevant and exempt deleted in accordance with section 25. I am satisfied it is practicable to do so as the effort involved in editing the documents would not require substantial time and effort, and the edited documents will retain meaning.

60. My decision on section 25 is outlined in the Schedule of Documents in **Annexure 1**.

²⁰ *Mickelborough v Victoria Police (General)* [2009] VCAT 2786 at [31]; *The Herald and Weekly Times Pty Limited v The Office of the Premier (General)* [2012] VCAT 967 at [82].

²¹ *Honeywood v Department of Human Services* [2006] VCAT 2048 at [26]; *RFJ v Victoria Police FOI Division (Review and Regulation)* [2013] VCAT 1267 at [140] and [155].

Conclusion

61. On the information before me, I am satisfied the exemptions in sections 32(1), 33(1), 34(1)(b), and 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the LG Act apply to the documents.
62. However, my decision on the Applicant's request differs from the Agency's decision in that I have decided to release additional information in the documents to the Applicant.
63. As I am satisfied it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of the documents with exempt and irrelevant information deleted in accordance with section 25, access to the documents is granted in part.
64. The Schedule of Documents in **Annexure 1** sets out my decision in relation to each document.

Review rights

65. If either party to this review is not satisfied with my decision, they are entitled to apply to the VCAT for it to be reviewed.²²
66. The Applicant may apply to VCAT for a review up to 60 days from the date they are given this Notice of Decision.²³
67. The Agency may apply to VCAT for a review up to 14 days from the date it is given this Notice of Decision.²⁴
68. Information about how to apply to VCAT is available online at www.vcat.vic.gov.au. Alternatively, VCAT may be contacted by email at admin@vcat.vic.gov.au or by telephone on 1300 018 228.
69. The Agency is required to notify the Information Commissioner in writing as soon as practicable if either party applies to VCAT for a review of my decision.²⁵

Third party review rights

70. As I have determined to release documents claimed exempt under sections 33(1) and 34(1)(b), if practicable, I am required to notify those persons of their right to seek review by VCAT of my decision within 60 days from the date they are given notice.²⁶
71. In this case, I am satisfied it is practicable to notify the relevant third parties of their review rights and confirm they will be notified of my decision on the date of decision.

When this decision takes effect

72. My decision does not take effect until the third parties' 60 day review period expires.
73. If a review application is made to VCAT, my decision will be subject to any VCAT determination.

²² The Applicant in section 50(1)(b) and the Agency in section 50(3D).

²³ Section 52(5).

²⁴ Section 52(9).

²⁵ Sections 50(3F) and 50(3FA).

²⁶ Sections 49P(5), 50(3), 50(3A) and 52(3).

Annexure 1 – Schedule of Documents

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| 1. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 33(1), 34(1)(b), 38 The document is to be released with the following information removed: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ name and signature of the external legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ information in the ‘narrative’ column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ○ the figures in the ‘H:MM’ columns is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names, initials and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email addresses of the external legal advisers is not | <p>Sections 38 and 32(1): Parts of the document detail tasks performed and narrations that disclose either directly or indirectly, communications concerning matters protected by legal professional privilege between the Agency and its external legal advisers. I am satisfied release of this information would disclose information provided for the dominant purpose of providing legal advice and is subject to legal professional privilege. Accordingly, I am satisfied this information is exempt from release under section 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the LG Act and section 32(1).</p> <p>However, the remainder of the document, including amounts for payment, general statements regarding services rendered and case reference numbers are not subject to legal professional privilege. Accordingly, I am not satisfied this information is exempt from release under either section 38 or 32(1).</p> <p>Sections 38 and 34(1)(b): I am satisfied the document contains information acquired by the Agency from a business undertaking which I am satisfied is of a business, commercial or financial nature. The document contains, in part, confidential commercial information regarding the time spent by individual;</p> |

| | | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <p>relevant and is to be deleted under section 25;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ telephone number, mobile telephone number and email address of the Executive Agency officer, which is exempt under sections 33(1) and 38; ● page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email addresses of the external legal advisers is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; ○ email address of the Executive Agency officer which is exempt under sections 33(1) and 38. | <p>advisers from which the undertaking's charge-out rates could be calculated. As I am satisfied release of the charge-out rates for individual external legal advisers in the context of a competitive legal services market would expose the business undertaking unreasonably to disadvantage particularly in circumstances where the proceedings are still on foot, I am satisfied this information is exempt from release under section 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the LG Act and section 34(1)(b).</p> <p>However, I am not satisfied disclosure of the total amounts charged over certain periods would expose the external legal advisers unreasonably to disadvantage. Accordingly, this information is not exempt from release under either section 38 or 34(1)(b).</p> <p>Sections 38 and 33(1): The document contains names, signatures and position titles. However, as outlined above, the Applicant advised they do not seek access to the personal affairs information of non-executive staff. Having considered all the material before me, I am of the view it would disclosure of the names of executive staff in the document would not be unreasonable. However, I am satisfied disclosure of their direct contact details would be unreasonable and is exempt from release under section 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the LG Act and section 33(1).</p> |
|--|--|--|--|--|---|--|

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | | <p>Information concerning the business and contact details of the external legal adviser and the Agency does not constitute personal affairs information. Accordingly, I am not satisfied this information is exempt from release under either section 38 or 33(1).</p> <p>Section 25: I am satisfied the document contains irrelevant information, being the names and contact information of non-executive Agency officers and external legal advisers as well as the legal adviser's bank account information.</p> <p>As I am satisfied it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of the document with exempt and irrelevant information deleted in accordance with section 25, access to this document is granted in part.</p> |
| 2. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ name and signature of external legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 | <p>Sections 38 and 34(1)(b): For the purpose of this review, I am satisfied the document contains information acquired from a business undertaking. I am also satisfied this information is of a business, commercial or financial nature. The document contains, in part, confidential commercial information regarding the undertaking's charge-out rates. I am satisfied release of the individual charge-out rates in the context of a highly competitive legal services market, would expose the relevant business undertaking</p> |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|---|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and to be deleted under section 25; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'H:MM' and 'value' columns are exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ○ the names, initials and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and contact information of the Agency officers is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and to be deleted under section 25. | <p>unreasonably to disadvantage particularly in circumstances where the proceedings are still on foot. Accordingly, I am satisfied this information is exempt from release under section 38 in conjunction with section 125(1) of the LG Act and section 34(1)(b).</p> <p>However, information about the total amounts charged by external legal advisers over certain periods would not expose the business undertaking unreasonably to disadvantage and is not exempt from release under Accordingly, I am not satisfied this information is exempt from release under either section 38 or 34(1)(b).</p> <p>Sections 32(1), 38 and 25: See comments for document 1.</p> |
| 3. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part</p> <p>Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 | <p>Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 1.</p> |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the name and signature of external legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'H:MM' columns are exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ○ the names, initials and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and contact information of the Agency officers is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 4. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 The document is to be released with the following information removed: | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 1. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the name and signature of external legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and to be deleted under section 25; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'H:MM' columns are exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ○ the names, initials and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and contact information of the Agency officers is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 5. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------|---|---------------|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email addresses of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information is to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; • pages 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under section 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under section 32(1) and 38; • page 5 | |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 6. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | <p>Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> | <p>Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; • pages 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | <p>Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2.</p> |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 7. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals are irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ● page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 8. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the name and email address of the agency officer is not relevant and is to remain deleted under section 25; ● pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ names of non-executive level individuals is not relevant and is to remain deleted under section 25; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 9. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 10. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 11. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names, and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ● pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ● page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |
| 12. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full | Release in part | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|---|---|---|
| | | | | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 13. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part</p> <p>Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ● pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ● page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 14. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 15. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 16. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 17. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 18. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 - 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 19. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 20. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 - 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals are irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 21. | [date] | Invoice | 7 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2, 3, 4 & 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 22. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <p>information to be deleted under section 25;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 23. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2, 3 & 4 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|---|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ● page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ● page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 24. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p>Sections 25, 32(1), 33(1) 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ● pages 2 & 3 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ● page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 25. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ● pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <p>irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; ● page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 26. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and email address of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ● pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|---|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 27. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| 28. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 33(1) 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |
| 29. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals are irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 30. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 31. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 32. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 33. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2, 3, 4 & 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 34. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 35. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 36. | [date] | Invoice | 10 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 1 & 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 3 - 9 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 10 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 37. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 38. | [date] | Invoice | 16 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 1 & 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 3 -14 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 16 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 39. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 40. | [date] | Invoice | 13 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 1 & 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 - 11 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 13 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 41. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 42. | [date] | Invoice | 17 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 1 & 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • pages 3 - 15 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'Hours' column is exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'narrative' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 17 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 43. | [date] | Invoice | 4 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and signature of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|--|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)' columns are exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 44. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and signature of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|---|
| | | | | | <p>information to be deleted under section 25;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)' columns are exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names, contact information and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 45. | [date] | Invoice | 8 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------|---|---------------|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and signature of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the 'worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)' columns are exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • page 7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ names and telephone numbers of non-executive level individuals is not relevant and is to be deleted in accordance with section 25; | |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 8 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names, contact information and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 46. | [date] | Invoice | 10 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and signature of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under sections 32(1) and 38; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the 'worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)' columns are exempt under sections 34(1)(b) and 38; ● page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the name of the third party is irrelevant information that is to be deleted under section 25. ● page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; ● page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names, contact information and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25. ● pages 9 & 10 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names, contact information and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 47. | [date] | Invoice | 12 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p style="text-align: center;">The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------|--|---------------|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2, 3 & 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under section 32(1) and 38; • page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)r' columns are exempt under section 34(1)(b) and 38; • page 7 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • pages 11 & 12 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names, contact information and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant | |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | information to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 48. | [date] | Invoice | 7 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p>Release in part Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • page 2 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under section 32(1) and 38; • page 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)' columns are exempt under section 34(1)(b) and 38; • page 4 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|---|---|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25; • pages 5, 6 & 7 ○ the names, contact information and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 49. | [date] | Invoice | 5 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; • pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under section 32(1) and 38; • page 4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|--|--|
| | | | | | <p>irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the figures in the worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)' columns are exempt under section 34(1)(b) and 38; ● page 5 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |
| 50. | [date] | Invoice | 6 | Refused in full Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 | <p style="text-align: center;">Release in part</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Sections 25, 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38</p> <p>The document is to be released with the following information removed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● page 1 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ● pages 2 & 3 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ information in the 'description' column is exempt under section 32(1) and 38; ● page 4 | Sections 32(1), 34(1)(b), 38 and 25: See comments for Document 2. |

| Document No. | Date of Document | Document Description | No. of Pages | Agency Decision | OVIC Decision | OVIC Comments |
|--------------|------------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------|--|---------------|
| | | | | | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ the names and position titles of non-executive level individuals is irrelevant information to be deleted under section 25; ○ the figures in the worked hours', 'billed hours' and 'rate (/hr)' columns are exempt under section 34(1)(b) and 38; • page 6 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ banking information of the legal adviser is not relevant and is to be deleted under section 25. | |