

Notice of Decision and Reasons for Decision

Applicant:	'EO3'
Agency:	Department of Justice and Community Safety
Decision date:	10 June 2022
Exemptions considered	Sections 28(1)(d), 30(1)
Citation:	'EO3' and Department of Justice and Community Safety (Freedom of Information) [2022] VICmr 157 (10 June 2022)

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION – Emergency Management Victoria – Emergency Management Commissioner – log books – handwritten notes – State Control Centre – meeting minutes – internal working documents – Cabinet deliberations or decisions

All references to legislation in this document are to the *Freedom of Information Act 1982* (Vic) (**FOI Act**) unless otherwise stated.

Notice of Decision

I have conducted a review under section 49F of the Agency's decision to refuse access to documents requested by the Applicant under the FOI Act.

My decision on the Applicant's request differs from the Agency's decision.

While I am satisfied certain information in the documents is exempt from release under section 28(1)(d), I am not satisfied the documents are exempt from release under section 30(1).

As I am satisfied it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of the documents with irrelevant and exempt information deleted in accordance with section 25, access to the documents is granted in part.

The Schedule of Documents in **Annexure 1** sets out my decision in relation to each document.

My reasons for decision follow.

Joanne Kummrow
Public Access Deputy Commissioner

10 June 2022

Reasons for Decision

Background to review

1. The Applicant made a request to the Agency seeking access to the following documents:
 1. A copy of all [Emergency Management Commissioner's] logbooks from [date] to date of this request
 2. A copy of all minutes of State Control Team (Class 1) meetings and State Emergency Management Team meetings.
2. The Agency identified 24 documents falling within the terms of the Applicant's request and refuse access to all documents under sections 28(1)(d), 30(1), 33(1), 35(1)(b). The Agency's decision letter sets out the reasons for its decision.

Review application

3. The Applicant sought review by the Information Commissioner under section 49A(1) of the Agency's decision to refuse access.
4. During the review, the Applicant indicated they do seek access to the personal affairs information of third parties. Accordingly, this information is irrelevant information for the purposes of section 25, which is discussed below.
5. I have examined a copy of the documents subject to review.
6. The Applicant and the Agency were invited to make a written submission under section 49H(2) in relation to the review.
7. I have considered all communications and submissions received from the parties.
8. In undertaking my review, I have had regard to the object of the FOI Act, which is to create a general right of access to information in the possession of the Government or other public bodies, limited only by exceptions and exemptions necessary to protect essential public interests, privacy and business affairs.
9. I note Parliament's intention the FOI Act must be interpreted so as to further the object of the Act and any discretions conferred by the Act must be exercised, as far as possible, so as to facilitate and promote the disclosure of information in a timely manner and at the lowest reasonable cost.
10. In conducting a review under section 49F, section 49P requires that I make a new or 'fresh decision'. Therefore, my review does not involve determining whether the Agency's decision is correct, but rather requires my fresh decision to be the 'correct or preferable decision'.¹ This involves ensuring my decision is correctly made under the FOI Act and any other applicable law in force at the time of my decision.

Preliminary view

11. During the review, the Agency sought to clarify each exemption relied upon in its decision on the Applicant's request. In relation to Document 1, it submits it refused access in full under section 33(1) and in part under sections 28(1)(d) and 30(1). In relation to Documents 2 to 24, it submits it refused access in full under section 35(1)(b) and in part under section 33(1).
12. The Agency was provided with my preliminary view that Document 1 is not exempt from release in full under sections 30(1) or 33(1), and Documents 2 to 24 are not exempt from release under

¹ *Drake v Minister for Immigration and Ethnic Affairs* (1979) 24 ALR 577 at 591.

sections 30(1) and 35(1)(b). The Agency was invited to provide a further submission or consider releasing further information.

13. In response to my preliminary view, the Agency:
 - (a) now relies on section 33(1) to refuse access to Document 1 in part, rather than in full;
 - (b) now relies on section 30(1) to refuse access to Document 1 in full, and section 28(1)(d) to refuse access in part;
 - (c) agreed to release further information in Documents 2 to 24, to which it previously refused access under sections 33(1) and 35(1)(b).
 - (d) no longer relies on section 35(1)(b) to exempt from release information in Documents 2 to 24; and
 - (e) relies on section 30(1) to exempt from release information in Documents 2 to 8 and 10 to 24.
14. The Agency also provided OVIC with a marked-up copy of the documents identifying its revised position on documents including the information to be released to the Applicant and its reliance on certain exemptions to refuse access to certain information in the documents.
15. Accordingly, my review focuses on the Agency's application of sections 30(1) and 28(1)(d) in relation to Documents 1 to 8 and 10 to 24.

Review of exemptions

Section 28(1)(d) – Deliberations or decisions of the Cabinet

16. Section 28(7) provides 'Cabinet' includes a committee or sub-committee of the Cabinet.
17. In relation to Cabinet documents and the exemptions under section 28(1), it has been said:

... a document is not exempt merely because it has some connection with Cabinet, or is perceived by departmental officers or others as being of a character that they believe ought be regarded as a Cabinet document or because it has some Cabinet "aroma" about it. Rather, for a document to come within the Cabinet document exemption, "it must fit squarely within one of the four exceptions" in section 28(1) of the Act.^[11] But the language used to describe the exemptions is itself open to different interpretations.²
18. Section 28(1)(d) provides a document is an exempt document if its disclosure would involve the disclosure of any deliberation or decision of the Cabinet, other than a document by which a decision of the Cabinet was officially published.
19. A document will be exempt under section 28(1)(d) if there is evidence the Cabinet discussed and determined options or issues set out in the document.³
20. A decision of the Cabinet includes a course of action set, or a determination made as to the final strategy for a matter or a conclusion as to how a matter should proceed.⁴

² *Ryan v Department of Infrastructure* [2004] VCAT 2346 at [33] (per Justice Morris, VCAT President) quoting *Birnbauer v Department of Industry Technology and Resources* [1986] 1 VAR 279.

³ *Smith v Department of Sustainability and Environment* (2006) 25 VAR 65; [2006] VCAT 1228 at [23].

⁴ *Della-Riva v Department of Treasury and Finance* (2005) 23 VAR 396; [2005] VCAT 2083 at [30].

21. Where a decision made by the Cabinet is subsequently made public, as is usually the case, releasing information about the outcome of a Cabinet decision will not necessarily disclose a decision or deliberation of the Cabinet for the purpose of section 28(1)(d).⁵
22. In *Asher v Department of Sustainability and Environment*,⁶ the Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal (**VCAT**) held that where a document, on its face, does not disclose a decision or deliberation of the Cabinet, or the extent of the Cabinet's interaction with a document is unclear, section 28(1)(d) will not apply.
23. As noted above, Document 1 contains the notes of the Emergency Management Commissioner. Given the nature of documents subject to section 28(1), I am limited in the amount of information I can provide about the information exempted from release by the Agency under section 28(1)(d). However, having reviewed the documents, I am satisfied disclosure of the document would reveal the deliberations of two committees of the Cabinet.
24. Accordingly, I am satisfied certain information in the document is exempt from release under section 28(1)(d).
25. My decision in relation to section 28(1)(d) is set out in the Schedule of Documents in **Annexure 1**.

Section 30(1) – Internal working documents

26. Section 30(1) has three requirements:
 - (a) the document must disclose matter in the nature of opinion, advice or recommendation prepared by an officer or Minister, or consultation or deliberation that has taken place between officers, Ministers or an officer and a Minister;
 - (a) such matter must be made in the course of, or for the purpose of, the deliberative processes involved in the functions of an agency or Minister or of the government; and
 - (b) disclosure of the matter would be contrary to the public interest.
27. The exemption does not apply to purely factual material in a document.⁷

Do the documents disclose matter in the nature of opinion, advice or recommendation prepared by an officer or Minister, or consultation or deliberation that has taken place between officers, Ministers or an officer and a Minister?

28. It is not necessary for a document to be in the nature of opinion, advice or recommendation. Rather, it is enough that release of the document would disclose matter of that nature.⁸
29. Document 1 is the notebook of the Emergency Management Commissioner. The remainder of the documents are minutes from State Control Team meetings and State Emergency Management Team meetings.
30. I am satisfied the documents contain information in the nature of opinion, advice and recommendations prepared by Agency officers.
31. However, I am not satisfied certain information in the documents, including descriptions of meetings, incidents and conversations between Agency officers constitutes opinion, advice or

⁵ *Honeywood v Department of Innovation, Industry and Regional Development* (2004) 21 VAR 1453; [2004] VCAT 1657 at [26].

⁶ [2010] VCAT 601.

⁷ Section 30(3).

⁸ *Mildenhall v Department of Education* (1998) 14 VAR 87.

recommendation. Rather, I consider the information is factual, being either a description of the events that occurred or actions taken by individuals following the events. Accordingly, this information is not exempt from release under section 30(1) as it does not satisfy the first limb of section 30(1).

Were the documents made in the course of, or for the purpose of, the deliberative processes involved in the functions of an Agency?

32. The term 'deliberative process' is interpreted broadly and includes any of the processes of deliberation or consideration involved in the functions of an agency, Minister or the government.⁹
33. In *Re Waterford and Department of Treasury (No.2)*,¹⁰ the former Victorian Administrative Appeals Tribunal held:

... "deliberative processes" [is] wide enough to include any of the processes of deliberation or consideration involved in the functions of an agency... In short, ...its thinking processes — the processes of reflection, for example, upon the wisdom and expediency of a proposal, a particular decision or a course of action.

34. I am satisfied the documents were made in the course of the Agency performing its deliberative functions in relation to managing and controlling State emergencies.

Would disclosure of the documents be contrary to the public interest?

35. In determining if disclosure of the documents would be contrary to the public interest, I must consider all relevant facts and circumstances remaining mindful the object of the FOI Act is to facilitate and promote the disclosure of information. In doing so, I have given weight to the following relevant factors:¹¹
- (a) the degree of sensitivity of the issues discussed in the documents and the broader context giving rise to the creation of the documents;
 - (b) the right of every person to gain access to documents under the FOI Act;
 - (c) the stage of a decision or status of policy development or a process being undertaken at the time the communications were made;
 - (d) whether disclosure of the documents would be likely to inhibit communications between Agency officers, essential for the Agency to make an informed and well-considered decision or participate fully and properly in a process in accordance with the Agency's functions and other statutory obligations;
 - (e) whether disclosure of the documents would give merely a part explanation, rather than a complete explanation for the taking of a particular decision or the outcome of a process, which the Agency would not otherwise be able to explain upon disclosure of the documents;
 - (f) the impact of disclosing documents in draft form, including disclosure not clearly or accurately representing a final position or decision reached by the Agency at the conclusion of a decision or process; and

⁹ *Brog v Department of Premier and Cabinet* (1989) 3 VAR 201 at 208.

¹⁰ [1984] AATA 67; (1984) 5 ALD 588; 1 AAR 1 at [58].

¹¹ *Hulls v Victorian Casino and Gambling Authority* (1998) 12 VAR 483.

- (g) the public interest in the community being better informed about the way in which the Agency carries out its functions, including its deliberative, consultative and decision making processes and whether the underlying issues require greater public scrutiny.

36. In relation to whether disclosure of the documents would be contrary to the public interest, the Agency submits:

... It would be contrary to the public interest to release the handwritten notes, often recorded in haste as the meeting progresses, as it would prematurely and inappropriately reveal the raw thoughts and opinion of the Commissioner that have not been appropriately prepared for dissemination.

One of the risks with releasing the handwritten notes as they are is that in its raw draft form it does not necessarily represent the Department's final position on particular matters and, given the seniority of the Commissioner for Emergency Services, disclosure might lead to undue weight or finality being attributed to those comments which could reasonably be misleading or confusing.³

[regarding Document 1]

The Department has relied on s30(1) in some instances throughout these documents. The approach taken was to release most of the material and only apply redactions under this exemption for safety related information where there are risk factors for emergency staff to manage or the information might otherwise be misunderstood or misconstrued in a way that could realistically cause confusion, uncertainty or fear within the community. For these reasons, the Department believes it is not in the public interest to release...

[regarding the remaining Documents]

37. On the information before me, I am not satisfied disclosure of the opinion, advice and recommendation in the documents would be contrary to the public interest for the following reasons:

- (a) I do not consider the information is particularly sensitive. The majority of the information exempted from release by the Agency relates to weather events and the Agency's response to those events. Certain parts of Document 1 contain purely administrative information in relation to the actions of the Emergency Management Commissioner. There is also publicly available information in relation to the events discussed in the meeting minutes.
- (b) There is a considerable public interest in the community being better informed about government decision making. By providing access to information that demonstrates the basis upon which decisions are made, disclosure of documents like these builds community trust in government and its decision making processes. Therefore, I consider disclosure of the documents serves the public interest in promoting open and accountable government.
- (c) I do not agree with the Agency's submission that disclosure of the information in the documents would cause confusion, uncertainty or fear within the community. I consider the Applicant, as a member of the Victorian Parliament, and also members of the public, are capable of understanding the context in which the documents were created and the discussions in the meeting minutes and notes may not reflect a final decision made by the Agency.

Nevertheless, it is open for the Agency to release the documents with any necessary additional information explaining the basis of any decision made to eliminate or minimise any potential for confusion or misunderstanding concerning the documents, should this be required.

- (d) I am not satisfied disclosure of the relevant information in the documents would negatively impact upon the nature or quality of advice and recommendations prepared by Agency officers in the future. I note the views of VCAT in *Graze v Commissioner for State Revenue*,¹² which observed the possibility of public scrutiny in some circumstances would provide for better

¹² [2013] VCAT 869 at [25]-[27].

administrative decision making. In any case, it is arguable Agency officers are responsible for ensuring advice provided is accurate, complete and properly considered on matters central to its governmental functions.

38. Accordingly, I am not satisfied disclosure of the relevant information in the documents would be contrary to the public interest, and is not exempt from release under section 30(1).
39. My decision in relation to section 30(1) is set out in the Schedule of Documents in **Annexure 1**.

Section 25 – Deletion of exempt or irrelevant information

40. Section 25 requires an agency to grant access to an edited copy of a document where it is practicable to delete exempt or irrelevant information and the applicant agrees to receiving such a copy.
41. Determining what is ‘practicable’ requires consideration of the effort and editing involved in making the deletions ‘from a resources point of view’¹³ and the effectiveness of the deletions. Where deletions would render a document meaningless, they are not ‘practicable’, and release of the document is not required under section 25.¹⁴

Personal affairs information

42. As noted above, the Applicant does not seek access to any third party’s personal affairs information.
43. Information relating to the ‘personal affairs’ of a person includes information that identifies any person or discloses their address or location. It also includes any information from which such information may be reasonably determined.¹⁵
44. VCAT has interpreted the scope of ‘personal affairs information’ broadly to include matters relating to health, private behaviour, home life or personal or family relationships of individuals.¹⁶
45. In its response to my preliminary view, the Agency submits certain information in Document 22 is exempt from release under section 30(1). Having reviewed the document, I confirm certain information relates to the health and wellbeing of a third party. I am satisfied this information is personal affairs information for the purposes of section 33(1) and is irrelevant for the purposes of section 25.

Practicability of deleting exempt and irrelevant information

46. I have considered whether it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of the documents with irrelevant and exempt deleted in accordance with section 25.
47. I am satisfied it is practicable to do so as the effort involved in editing the documents would not require substantial time and effort, and the edited documents will retain meaning.
48. My decision on section 25 is outlined in the Schedule of Documents in Annexure 1.

¹³ *Mickelborough v Victoria Police (General)* [2009] VCAT 2786 at [31]; *The Herald and Weekly Times Pty Limited v The Office of the Premier (General)* [2012] VCAT 967 at [82].

¹⁴ *Honeywood v Department of Human Services* [2006] VCAT 2048 at [26]; *RFJ v Victoria Police FOI Division (Review and Regulation)* [2013] VCAT 1267 at [140] and [155].

¹⁵ Section 33(9).

¹⁶ *Re F and Health Department* (1988) 2 VAR 458 as quoted in *RFJ v Victoria Police FOI Division* [2013] VCAT 1267 at [103].

Conclusion

49. On the information before me, I am satisfied certain information in the documents is exempt from release under section 28(1)(d). However, I am not satisfied the documents are exempt from release under section 30(1).
50. As I am satisfied it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of the documents with irrelevant and exempt information deleted in accordance with section 25, access to the documents is granted in part.
51. The Schedule of Documents in **Annexure 1** sets out my decision in relation to each document.

Review rights

52. If either party to this review is not satisfied with my decision, they are entitled to apply to VCAT for it to be reviewed.¹⁷
53. The Applicant may apply to VCAT for a review up to 60 days from the date they are given this Notice of Decision.¹⁸
54. The Agency may apply to VCAT for a review up to 14 days from the date it is given this Notice of Decision.¹⁹
55. Information about how to apply to VCAT is available online at www.vcat.vic.gov.au. Alternatively, VCAT may be contacted by email at admin@vcat.vic.gov.au or by telephone on 1300 018 228.
56. The Agency is required to notify the Information Commissioner in writing as soon as practicable if either party applies to VCAT for a review of my decision.²⁰

When this decision takes effect

57. My decision does not take effect until the Agency's 14 day review period expires.
58. If a review application is made to VCAT, my decision will be subject to any VCAT determination.

¹⁷ The Applicant in section 50(1)(b) and the Agency in section 50(3D).

¹⁸ Section 52(5).

¹⁹ Section 52(9).

²⁰ Sections 50(3F) and 50(3FA).

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
1.	[date]	Logbook handwritten notes	78	<p>Refused in full</p> <p>Sections 28(1)(d), 30(1), 33(1)</p>	<p>Release in part</p> <p>Sections 28(1)(d), 25</p> <p>The document is to be released except for the information exempted from release by the Agency under section 28(1)(d) and the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and is to be deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>	<p>During the review, the Agency submitted the document is exempt under section 30(1) in full and sections 28(1)(d) and 33(1) in part.</p> <p>Section 30(1): For the reasons outlined in the Notice of Decision, I am not satisfied this document is exempt from release under section 30(1).</p> <p>Section 28(1)(d): For the reasons outlined in the Notice of Decision, I am satisfied certain information in the document is exempt from release under section 28(1)(d).</p> <p>Section 25: The Applicant does not seek access to the personal affairs information of third parties. Accordingly, I am satisfied this information is irrelevant for the purpose of section 25.</p> <p>I am satisfied it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of this document with exempt and irrelevant information deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
2.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	7	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	During the review, the Agency agreed to release certain information in this document to the Applicant, which it previously exempt from release under sections 33(1) and 35(1)(b). The Agency also advised it relies on section 30(1) to exempt from release certain parts of the document. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
3.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	8	Refused in full Sections 30(1), 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
4.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	9	Refused in full Sections 30(1), 33(1)	Release in part Section 25	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
					The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	<p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>
5.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	9	<p>Refused in full</p> <p>Section 33(1)</p>	<p>Release in part</p> <p>Section 25</p> <p>The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>	<p>See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.</p> <p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>
6.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	8	<p>Refused in full</p> <p>Section 33(1)</p>	<p>Release in part</p> <p>Section 25</p> <p>The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>	<p>See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.</p> <p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
7.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	8	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
8.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	7	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
9.	[date]	Meeting Agenda	7	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
					which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
10.	[date]	Meeting Agenda	7	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
11.	[date]	Meeting Agenda	6	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
12.	[date]	Meeting Agenda	6	Refused in full	Release in part	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
				Section 33(1)	Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
13.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	6	Refused in full Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
14.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	8	Refused in full Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
					deleted in accordance with section 25.	Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
15.	[date]	Meeting Agenda	7	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
16.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	6	Refused in full Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
17.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	7	Refused in full Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)	Release in part Section 25	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
					The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	<p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>
18.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	6	<p>Refused in full</p> <p>Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)</p>	<p>Release in part</p> <p>Section 25</p> <p>The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>	<p>See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.</p> <p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>
19.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	5	<p>Refused in full</p> <p>Sections 33(1),35(1)(b)</p>	<p>Release in part</p> <p>Section 25</p> <p>The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>	<p>See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.</p> <p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
20.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	7	Refused in full Section 33(1)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
21.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	6	Refused in full Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1. Section 25: See comments for Document 1.
22.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	10	Refused in full Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)	Release in part Section 25 The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information	See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant. Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
					which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.	<p>Section 25: I am satisfied that certain information which the Agency deemed exempt under section 30(1) is personal affairs information for the purposes of section 33(1). As the Applicant does not seek access to this information, I am satisfied it is irrelevant.</p> <p>I am satisfied it is practicable to provide the Applicant with an edited copy of this document with irrelevant information deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>
23.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	6	<p>Refused in full</p> <p>Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)</p>	<p>Release in part</p> <p>Section 25</p> <p>The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>	<p>See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.</p> <p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>
24.	[date]	Meeting Minutes	7	<p>Refused in full</p> <p>Sections 33(1), 35(1)(b)</p>	<p>Release in part</p> <p>Section 25</p>	<p>See comments for Document 2 in relation to exemptions relied on by the Agency and its agreement to release of certain information to the Applicant.</p>

Document No.	Date of Document	Document Description	No. of pages	Agency Decision	OVIC Decision	OVIC Comments
					<p>The document is to be released except for the personal affairs information which is irrelevant information and to be deleted in accordance with section 25.</p>	<p>Section 30(1): See comments for Document 1.</p> <p>Section 25: See comments for Document 1.</p>