

# Security and Privacy of Surveillance Technologies in Public Places

Ben Hasker  
Sector Director, Performance Audit

Tony Brown  
Senior Audit Manager, Performance Audit

21 November 2018

**VAGO**

# Outline:

- Auditor-General's role and powers
- Overview of the performance audit process
- Overview of *Security and Privacy of Surveillance Technologies in Public Places* audit , including:
  - approach
  - findings
  - recommendations
- Questions and comments.

# Auditor-General's role and powers

The Auditor-General is:

- an independent officer of the Victorian Parliament
- appointed to examine the management of resources within the public sector on behalf of Parliament and Victorians.

The Auditor-General conducts and reports on financial and performance audits.

# Victoria's integrity system

Independent Broad-based Anti-corruption Commission	Victorian Ombudsman	Victorian Auditor-General's Office
Investigate and prevent serious corruption across the public sector and police misconduct	Investigate administrative actions of state government departments, local councils and statutory authorities	Provides independent assurance to the Parliament and the Victorian community on the financial integrity and performance of the state

Other agencies supporting a sound integrity system include: Local Government Investigations and Compliance Inspectorate, FOI, Privacy and Data Protection, Victorian Public Sector Commission, Equal Opportunity and Human Rights Commissioners

# Auditor-General role and powers:

Our audits can examine:

- effectiveness, efficiency, and economy of agencies, programs and services
- quality of resources management
- opportunities for improvements in management practices and systems
- the fair presentation of annual financial statements and performance statements
- compliance with legislative and other requirements
- wastage or lack of probity in the management of public resources.

Recommendations promote accountability and transparency in government, and improvements in service efficiency and effectiveness.

Audit findings and recommendations: Reported to Parliament and publicly available.

# Auditor-General role and powers

Our work is facilitated and governed by the *Audit Act 1994*.

Under the Act:

- **We can** – conduct financial and performance audits and access broad range of documents under Section 11 of the Act. This includes Cabinet documents.
- **We cannot** -
  - question the merits of policy objectives of the government
  - provide an absolute assurance of the truth of agency information
  - enforce recommendations
  - resolve individual matters of contention.
- We conduct our audits in accordance with Australian Auditing Standards.

# Performance audit process

Performance audits:

- are identified and consulted on through our Annual Planning process
- typically last 9 months and involve 3 phases: planning, conduct and reporting
- are undertaken by small teams with supplementary resources and expertise added where needed
- involve extensive engagement with audited agencies and stakeholders
- are ultimately reported to the Parliament.

# *Security and Privacy of Surveillance Technologies in Public Places: Background*



Surveillance in public places  
is increasing



Surveillance impacts the  
privacy of individuals and  
councils need to comply with  
legislation



# Background



- ***‘Public safety CCTV systems’***  
Used by Victoria Police  
Councils own and maintain



- ***‘Corporate CCTV systems’***  
Installed in council offices, pools, libraries,  
performing arts centres and waste facilities.

# Focus of this audit



- Is council surveillance in line with the *Privacy and Data Protection Act 2014*?
- Do councils adequately protect surveillance information from unauthorised use and disclosure?

Council	Public safety CCTV cameras	Corporate CCTV cameras	Total CCTV cameras	Cameras per 10 000 residents
Melbourne	72 <sup>(a)</sup>	298	370	27.3
Whitehorse	47	203	250	14.9
Hume	21	297	318	15.9
East Gippsland	22	124	146	32.9
Horsham	31	76	107	53.8
<b>Total</b>	<b>193</b>	<b>998</b>	<b>1 191</b>	

(a) Melbourne expects to have 155 cameras in place through its Safe City Camera Program in the central business district by 31 December 2018.

# Audit approach

We used legislative requirements and authoritative guidance to design and conduct our audit:

- The *Privacy and Data Protection Act 2014*: the *Information Privacy Principles* and data security requirements
- *Guide to Developing CCTV for public safety in Victoria* (Department of Justice in August 2011 and updated in June 2018)
- *Closed Circuit Television in Public Places—Guidelines* (Victorian Ombudsman in November 2012)
- *Guidelines to surveillance and privacy in the Victorian public sector* (CPDP in May 2017).

## What we found

## What needs to happen



Gaps in policies and procedures

Develop, review and implement policies and procedures

Limited consideration of privacy impacts when installing new CCTV cameras

Assess privacy impacts and consult communities

Only Melbourne sufficiently oversighted its public safety CCTV system

Meet commitments to oversight and review, as agreed with Victoria Police

Only two councils adequately oversight corporate CCTV systems

Allocate responsibility for oversight and reporting on corporate systems

# Privacy and data security: What we found

- Inadequate signage for corporate CCTV systems
- Weaknesses in physical security for CCTV equipment
- Poor access controls with generic user logins
- Failure to use system activity logs to track CCTV use

**Councils need to better protect the privacy of individuals by improving and testing physical security and access controls.**



# Recommendations

## **1 recommendation for Horsham Rural City Council**

Establish and implement a CCTV policy.

## **1 recommendation for City of Whitehorse**

Establish an agreement with Victoria Police for the public safety CCTV system at the Box Hill mall.

# Recommendations

## 9 recommendations for Melbourne, Whitehorse, Hume, Horsham and East Gippsland

- review and update CCTV policies to address the PDPA requirements
- assess CCTV systems for compliance with policy
- develop operating procedures for corporate CCTV systems
- assess the privacy impacts of proposals for new CCTV surveillance devices
- allocate senior management responsibility for CCTV systems and report on use
- undertake periodic internal audits of CCTV system use and data security
- improve signage for corporate CCTV systems
- address access control and data security weaknesses for corporate CCTV systems
- regular audits and evaluations of public safety CCTV systems and hold system oversight committees to account for meeting responsibilities agreed with Victoria Police.

# Overall message

The councils examined in this audit could not demonstrate that they were consistently meeting their commitments to the community to ensure the protection of private information collected through CCTV systems.

For more information on our audits and reports please visit:

<https://www.audit.vic.gov.au/>